

Dorothy Byrne Chair Ethical Journalism Network



What a year it has been for an organisation devoted to supporting ethical journalism.

We are, as our name says, a network of journalists across the world who believe in supporting ethics in journalism and in fighting the dissemination of lies and the undermining of reporters who try to tell the truth. But suddenly we couldn't meet each other because of Covid-19.

Fortunately, our profession has taught us how to communicate in the most difficult of circumstances; wars, under authoritarian regimes, when our bosses order us to purvey hate speech, reporting lying leaders in democracies; so, we coped with a virtual world of communication pretty well. Indeed, we have held some important virtual events this year about subjects as diverse as the implication of Black Lives Matter for newsrooms and how to responsibly report suicide.

We have created ground-breaking reports about areas of Europe where the threats to ethical journalism have been deeply worrying; Poland, Hungary and Bulgaria. At the start of 2021 we will publish two more in this series from the Czech Republic and Slovakia. We identified the threats to independent media, indicated how solidarity can be built and shared both practical ideas and good guidance. Now we are planning how to do more; aware as we are that free and ethical journalism is essential for democracy. These projects were supported by the Evens Foundation and Fritt Ord to whom we are very grateful.

We have supported colleagues in Turkey who have been faced with massive challenges. Our colleagues at the Coalition for Ethical Journalism, financially supported through our projects by the Norwegian Foreign Ministry and Fritt Ord, have helped to keep truthful journalism alive.

We have been working with media organisations in the Middle East and in the Balkans to help develop bespoke media audits through which they can create self-governing systems for ethical journalism. These projects were supported by International Media Support, Free Press Unlimited and UNESCO..

This work in the most difficult areas of the world in which journalists operate is vital to our purpose. We plan to raise funds and find new partners to do more in those areas in the coming year. We continue to be massively grateful to the Norwegian Foreign Ministry for its support. We are also grateful to the Potter Foundation for contribution to core costs in difficult times, and to the following Norwegian organisations: Mentor Medier, Kopinor, MBL (Norwegian Business Association), Tinius Trust, Nent Group/P4, Egmont Publishing/TV2, Schibsted News, Polaris Media.

As I write this, Covid-19 vaccines are being rolled out across the world and so are the lies about them. We plan a series of events on disinformation about Covid-19 and science. Ethical journalism is literally a matter of life and death now. In 2021, we will turn our focus strongly towards social media platforms and digital journalism.

The EJN has just been awarded a significant grant by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation to examine the issue of structural racism in UK news media and and to examine ways forward. We hope to roll that research and ensuing work out into other territories and this will be a major area on which we focus and seek funds

We are now holding regular panels and I link to some here.

- Words Hurt: Ethical Reporting on Race, EJN panel September 10 2020 - YouTube
- Responsible reporting on suicide and mental health - a panel from the Ethical Journalism Network - YouTube
- Responsible Reporting on Domestic Violence -EJN panel (24 Nov, 2020) - YouTube

In this year, we have revitalised our organisation; increasing the number of trustees, bringing in trustees from diverse backgrounds and with significant relevant experience. We are also in the process of setting up a new network of committees which will work actively to support the organisation in their regions. The UK committee has been formed and the International Committee and Norwegian/Swedish Committee are in the process of formation.

Our work has never been of greater importance. We have done great work and more is underway. Our new structure revitalises us.

Hannah Storm

Director & CEO Ethical Journalism Network



2020 was a year like no other. It brought the biggest global story in living memory for most of the world's population. The unprecedented pandemic reframed journalism, both in terms of the conditions for our industry and the way we tell our stories. But it also underscored the essential need for accurate. accountable journalism, rooted in humanity: the kind of journalism which lies at the heart of the work we do at the Ethical Journalism Network.

At the EJN, we were forced like everyone else to reframe our work, almost overnight. We are a global network, and the pandemic put a brake on our travel and our ability to connect physically with our colleagues around the world.

But in this disconnected landscape, our small core team responded nimbly, so we were able to continue our project work, delivering content and convening conversations in a connected, collaborative way.

The pandemic exacerbated another type of pressure on the press – that of misinformation, something which led the World Health Organisation called an infodemic, and we were forced to sort fact from falsehood knowing that people's lives might depend on the information we shared

One of the first pieces of focussed work we did in response to the pandemic was an infographic for journalists covering Covid-19, which was shared widely, translated into multiple languages and formed the basis of various webinars and online training we offered to our global partners.

By moving our work online, we were able to ensure we created more diverse content to support our network remotely - piloting a podcast series, commissioning and publishing articles at the intersection of ethics and journalism from dozens of media experts worldwide, participating in workshops and offering panels and training that reached hundreds of journalists in dozens of countries.

Our project works has spanned the globe and has included supporting journalists on responsible migration reporting in Pakistan, researching challenges to independent media in Central and Eastern Europe, collaborating with our colleagues at the Coalition for

Ethical Journalism in Turkey, creating bespoke audits for newsrooms in the Balkans and the Middle East, as well as developing ethical guidelines on open-source reporting on issues of security and nuclear proliferation in the US and Europe.

While our work has seen us travel less since the emergence of the pandemic, in the months before we were carrying out our projects, extending our partnerships and continuing to build our coalitions from South Korea to Turkey, Italy to Iraq, and many countries in between.

This was a year in which authorities around the world used protests and the pandemic as an excuse to clamp down on press freedom, and yet it was a year in which we saw journalists and communities come together to bravely and boldly counter some of those pressures, even as some of the year's biggest news stories underscored the particular burden carried by certain people, particularly those from Black and Minority Ethnic communities

We have spent time this year listening even more to our networks, hearing from them how we can best serve and connect them, understanding how we can respond better to provide practical connections, advice, tools and training to promote journalism ethics in the work we create and in the cultures of newsrooms.

We are about to embark on a piece of work funded by the Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust identifying and addressing structural racism in UK newsrooms and we know that we can only do this in collaboration with our wider journalism community. Likewise, we have boosted our work this year in other areas where there are systemic issues in terms of the content and cultures of our news and newsrooms: and we are committed to continuing our work at the intersection of ethics and gender and ethics and mental health, after two very well received panels earlier this year and separate pieces of work in both these spaces.

We are pleased to welcome to our Board, new trustees who bring with them vast experience and diverse perspectives, and as we look ahead to 2021, we are about to launch a UK committee and international commit to promote our work and networks further.

As we look ahead to the next phase of the EJN's existence, we do so with a greater understanding of what our priorities of, of the impact we are having and with an even stronger resolve to advance conversations around ethical journalism, having seen its value underscored in this past year.

I am grateful to all who have supported us in this unprecedented year, and in particular to our EJN team with whom I have worked who have reminded me daily of the purpose of our work.

Our five core principles of ethical journalism

Truth & Accuracy

Journalists cannot always guarantee 'truth', but getting the facts right is the cardinal principle of journalism. We should always strive for accuracy, give all the relevant facts we have and ensure that they have been checked. When we cannot corroborate information we should say so.

Independence

Journalists must be independent voices; we should not act, formally or informally, on behalf of special interests whether political, corporate or cultural. We should declare to our editors - or the audience - any of our political affiliations, financial arrangements or other personal information that might constitute a conflict of interest.

Fairness and Impartiality

Most stories have at least two sides. While there is no obligation to present every side in every piece, stories should be balanced and add context. Objectivity is not always possible, and may not always be desirable (in the face for example of brutality or inhumanity), but impartial reporting builds trust and confidence.

Humanity

Journalists should do no harm. What we publish or broadcast may be hurtful, but we should be aware of the impact of our words and images on the lives of others.

Accountability

A sure sign of professionalism and responsible journalism is the ability to hold ourselves accountable. When we commit errors we must correct them and our expressions of regret must be sincere not cynical. We listen to the concerns of our audience. We may not change what readers write or say but we will always provide remedies when we are unfair.

Highlights

- ► Central Eastern Europe
- ▶ Middle East
- ► Turkey
- Balkans
- ► UK

Priority areas

Countering hate speech in the following contexts:

- ► Race and identity
- ► Gender
- Migration
- ► Religion

Addressing challenges to independent media

Coalition building and support

Ethical media audits



From participating in panels, to giving speeches, moderating, and facilitating workshops and offering webinars, we have shared our expertise in person and remotely, through EJN organised events and in collaboration with others. This work has seen us collaborate with the European Federation of Journalists, The Frontline Club, Global Forum for Media Development, Global Investigative Journalists' Network, Asia-Pacific Broadcast Union, Poynter, Arabic Reporters for Investigative Journalism, as well as various universities, and others in our wide network.



Tools and Training

- ► Ethics in Data Journalism
- ► Migration reporting toolkit
- ► Reporting on Covid-19: Content (in collaboration with the Thomson Foundation)

Our podcast series was piloted in response to the pandemic and included conversations at the cross-section of Covid-19 and ethical journalism, including the following:

- Iraqi media and disinformation during the pandemic
- ► Covering domestic abuse ethically during lockdown
- ► Challenges for independent news in the
- ► Covid-19 and the impact on community news

Podcasts

Infographics

▶ 7 points on how to ethical report on pandemics.

Our infographic on the ethical reporting of pandemics has been translated into French, Spanish, Arabic, Somali, Serbian and Turkish.



▶ 6 point guide to ethical reporting on domestic violence. Our infographic on the responsible reporting of domestic violence was created as part of our ethics and gender work and after collaboration with colleagues who took part in our November 2020 panel on the responsible coverage of domestic violence. We aim to translate it into various languages and offer webinars and workshops based on its content.



Duty of care

Why conversations around ethical journalism need to concentrate on newsroom cultures as well as content

By Hannah Storm

Conversations around ethical journalism have traditionally focused on the content created by people in the media. But until we really start recognising the link between the cultures in place in newsrooms and the content created, we are doing a disservice to any

Until we create news rooms and environments that really subscribe to the notions of humanity, accountability, accuracy, fairness and independence, we stand very little chance of really creating journalism that does the same.

Ethics is also about duty of care. It's about looking after the people who work for us. It's about ensuring newsrooms reflect the audiences and communities we serve, creating places that are more inclusive towards those who have been traditionally marginalised in and by the media.

At the Ethical Journalism Network, we want to work with people across the media to support journalists both in the content they create and in the cultures they instill in newsrooms. We want to help newsrooms practically invest in systems of good governance and self-regulation that support a more sustainable future for ethical media.

Recent months have underscored the value, relevance and necessity of good, accountable, accurate, representative journalism with humanity at its heart. At the same time as an industry, we are facing challenging times.

We have been forced to reinvent decades of work in days and weeks, finding ways to navigate the uncertainty and enormity of a global pandemic that has changed our ways of connecting and collecting news. We are unlikely to go back to the newsrooms of the past.

And yet, many in our industry are exhausted. Years of relentless breaking news, falling ad revenues, increased attacks against our profession online, the rise of disinformation and misinformation, and a crisis of trust – all of these factors have impacted our working conditions.

This year too we have seen underscored the unique and acute mental health burden faced by our colleagues of colour, following the brutal murder of George Floyd and the ensuing protests connected with the Black Lives Matter movement, and the manner in which Covid-19 has disproportionately affected ethnic minority communities.

Perhaps this is the moment when we can really take stock and think about what we mean when we talk about journalism ethics. From a newsroom perspective, it's about having the codes of conduct in place that encourage the right kind of cultures to thrive, that enable empathy and leadership – about creating places and spaces where trust and humanity thrive, where managers lead by example, where they communicate policies clearly and listen, where they are flexible enough to understand that the old norms that shaped our industry are not necessary the only norms or even the most appropriate norms.

Survey after survey have spoken of the narrow demographics at management level in the media, about the lack of diversity in our newsrooms, particularly amongst those in charge and the resultant absence that many audiences feel in terms of representation, while those thinking about entering the industry often lack role models with whom they can identify, and the further up the ladder people climb, the more acute this becomes.



Until we create news rooms and environments that really subscribe to the notions of humanity, accountability, accuracy, fairness and independence, we stand very little chance of really creating journalism that does the same.

- Hannah Storm, EJN Director & CEO

I've been convening conversations across the industry, encouraging more open discussions about mental health and wellbeing. My conversations have been corroborated by research that shows heightened levels of anxiety and stress amongst journalists and it's clear many are struggling.

People are also scared to admit the fact they are suffering, worried this will impact their reputations and their career prospects, particularly if they are already marginalised by and in the media. And at a time when many newsrooms are having to consider job cuts, the threat of losing one's livelihood is a real and present threat to many people's mental health and to the ability of many journalists' to openly discuss their experiences if they are suffering.

From my own experiences of learning the language of mental health in the media and my own diagnosis of mental illness, it's also clear we need to take this more seriously than we have been as an industry at large.

The fact is we can't do our best work as journalists if we are not well, and if the environments within which we work do not allow us to feel safe and share our experiences. And yet, when people are not well, we all suffer, ethically, economically, environmentally.

As journalists, we are often reluctant to be the story, and perhaps we don't always need to be. But it's time we recognised that by encouraging environments where people are not forced to suffer in silence, by investing in promoting wellness, inclusivity and empathy, where will encourage humanity, accountability, accuracy, and fairness to thrive. Only

then will we really be able to translate that into the work we create and truly talk about ethical journalism.

Hannah Storm has spoken and written extensively throughout the year about how Covid-19 has impacted the mental health of journalists, and exacerbated some of the stressors they were already facing. She has shared her experiences, expertise and insights in the field of psychological safety and emotional wellbeing, offering practical suggestions and convening conversations. Her work is aimed at encouraging more open discussions of a subject that still carries stigma in our industry, one that tends to affect those who are traditionally marginalised within or by the media more. She continues to work with news organisations and individual journalists to raise awareness of the importance of creating safe spaces for people to share their experiences, offering tips as to how managers and individuals can do this, and increasing recognition of the fact that an absence of these ethical practices can impact on journalists' ability to do their jobs well and safely.

Ethics and Race

This year has underscored the particular burden faced by Black and Ethnic Minority journalists and and other Black men and women in the United States, and further afield, and the ensuing protests and coverage of the Black Lives Matter movement within the global media brought a renewed focus society. Many of our Black and Brown colleagues found themselves reporting these stories for bringing additional pressures to bear for them. At the EJN, we recognise the need for us to better represent people of all racial and ethnic identities in the media and to work to promote more ethical coverage of race and identity. We are developing and delivering practical advice for journalists reporting on structural racism and we organised a panel for eminent Black journalists discussed the importance

of language and how the content created by newsrooms cannot be divorced from cultures which still lack inclusivity. Two of the panellists, Keme Nzerem and Ayshah Tull have now joined the EJN as trustees, and a third, Daniel Henry is joining our UK committee. We are grateful to him for collating the infographic and to all of them for their support and allyship. As we look ahead to our priorities, ethics and race will be a significant focus of our work. We will continue to support journalists in recognising identity, recognising and countering misinformation and hate speech which incites racial, ethnic and just received a grant from the Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust to undertake a project identifying and responding to structural racism in the UK news media and we look forward to working with leading experts in this field and supporting our colleagues to do whatever we can to address, and reject racism in reporting and in news environments.

Now more than ever feels like a critical time for journalism. We are the ones who stand in the way to stamp out misinformation, challenge politicians on the decisions they make and give a voice to those who are underrepresented and often unheard. As a black female in this industry I've worked hard to do this with empathy, honesty and integrity and I want to make sure other journalists have the support and tools to do the same

- Ayshah Tull, EJN Trustee

Ethics and gender

We consider gender to be central to conversations around ethical journalism. We know that too often the voices of women have been marginalised in our industry and in the content created by journalists. Even where those voices feature, they often do so in a way that reinforces outdated stereotypes or fails to centralise and sensitively reflect women in the news content and conversations.

At the EJN, our work cuts across content and cultures. We know that the work we do on gender also intersects with the work we do to support journalists in reporting responsibly on other issues such as hate speech, migration, race and representation. We are creating content to support journalists to more responsibly report on news stories relating to women, through the development of online tips and tools. We are also working to facilitate conversations and to amplify the great work done by our partners.

We know that around the world there is a great deal of work to do to support newsrooms to more ethically and sensitively cover the stories of women and girls, and to break down barriers in our industry which reinforce outdated gender inequities. In this period, we facilitated conversations at the ARIJ conference with women journalists about some of the challenges they face in their work environments and their reporting. We have invested time in strengthening partnerships with other organisations working in this field, because we know that together we are stronger and alliances and amplification of efforts help when it comes to tackling gender inequity.

Our CEO, Hannah Storm, has continued to share her expertise on the gendered impact of online harassment and the way in which this intersects with ethical journalism, as it can lead to censorship, a loss of female voices, and affect the ability of journalists to do their jobs – in particular women and other marginalised members of the media society. As such she ran workshops for journalists in Turkey, in partnership with the European Journalism Federation, and online with Civil Rights Defenders. She also also facilitated a conversation in Brussels on behalf of the End FGM European network, about the roles and responsibilities of journalists in reporting on issues related to Female Genital Mutilation in a sensitive and non-stigmatising way.

We have ensured that the work we have commissioned for our Ethics in the News series, through our podcast pilot, and the content on our website has included the voices of as many women as possible.

We worked with our colleagues at the Coalition for Ethical Journalism in Turkey for a conversation about ways in which journalists could more responsibly report on femicide in the Turkish media, and we featured a piece on our website by our colleague Mina Tumay about this issue.

One of the pieces we commissioned was about how Covid-19 had increased the risk to women with regards to domestic violence, and how journalists could better cover stories of domestic violence.

This led us to collate good practice in an infographic for journalists available online and our aim is to also create online training tools for journalists.

In addition, Janey Starling and David Challen, both of whom have significant experience advocating for a better understanding of issues related to this topic, joined us for a podcast to share tips for journalists. They were among the participants in a panel discussion, along with Shaista Aziz of Solace Women's Aid, and Oisika Chakrabati of UN Women.



Building Trust in Journalism in Central Eastern Europe

This project, combining multiple countries and multiple donors, reflects the scale of the EJN's commitment to media independence. In it, we developed several policy papers which explored the state of the media in five central European countries. This work was based on research studies conducted by the EJN carried out in 2019 and 2020. Considering the situations in Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland and Slovakia, our work sought to address the challenges facing media workers when they try to report ethically, and it explored the relationship between ethical journalism and trust in the media. The project was developed in partnership with the Evens Foundation and the Fritt Ord Foundation.

Hungary

From September 2019 to March 2020, the EJN carried out extensive interviews with media organisations and journalists in Hungary and then worked with Hungarian media practitioners and academics to examine the findings. The report highlighted an endemic lack of trust in media reporting, and an environment in which ethical principles are continually challenged by the overriding political and economic context of the country. The government has been asserting control in a variety of ways and it is making it increasingly problematic for journalists to work ethically. Since 2010, the majority of media financing, advertising markets and commercial revenue streams have been captured by the government and associated actors and the public media continues to act in the government rather than public interest. Media capture is a form of media power whereby government and private sectors collude to control information and media systems in a country. In Hungary, the pro-government media scene is largely supported by oligarchs and media moguls. Independent media platforms live in financial fear, and face being bought out by pro-government tycoons. Key practices in the field of ethical journalism, such as sourcing and accuracy, are often compromised as a result.

Recommendations

The EJN's recommendations are to help strengthen trust between Hungarian journalists and their audiences, and are aimed at policy-makers and media practitioners. They include the following:

1. Pressure from outside

The European Union and the European Parliament should increase pressure on the Hungarian government to support a more pluralistic media framework. The EU should threaten to freeze grants and financial aid and apply sanctions - including the withdrawal of Hungary's voting rights within the bloc - if it continually fails to comply with EU policies on media freedoms.

2. Better support networks

More robust support networks are needed in Hungary. The Hungarian Association of Journalist needs to attract a younger membership and provide them with learning opportunities and resources. Regional and international networks could also share knowledge and help support journalists.



The European Union and the European Parliament should increase pressure on the Hungarian government to support a more pluralistic media framework.

3. Finance independent media

Direct financial support is needed from donors to develop content and resources, along with funding to train and educate journalists in making grant applications. Financial backing for technology solutions for paywalls would enable emerging media platforms to grow. Better provision of funding for investigative work and independent media development should be made available in the country by the donor and philanthropic communities.

4. Teach ethical journalism skills

Most journalists have had access to higher education, but few courses focus on professional and ethical journalism skills, and how to apply practically what they have learned. Partnerships with international academic institutions, online learning and guest lectureships would bring a greater knowledge from outside Hungary, updating curricula and developing stronger relations with European and international universities.

5. Improve media literacy

Helping the audience to learn to recognise disinformation and hate speech would encourage greater professionalism and accountability within the media. This would lead to more innovation and the development of content which better meets the needs of audiences. Teaching journalism students to be media literate is also crucial.

6. Online harassment and defamation

Hungarian journalists need help in dealing with increasing attacks from the government and its allies. Harassment, in the form of smear campaigns, is rife. Attacks need to be documented and followed up with the support of media freedom and journalism safety organisations. Journalists and media practitioners in Hungary should call on regional and international networks to support them.

Poland

Polish journalists face the gravest threat to their independence since the end of the Communist era, according to the EJN's findings. Poland is a deeply divided society, and this is reflected in the country's polarised media environment. A large number of newspapers, broadcasters and online sites are aligned to political parties and religious or ideological groups, and their content reflects these associations. State-run media provides the government with a platform for party propaganda and allows it to dominate the narrative with hate speech and xenophobia. Harassment of journalists is becoming commonplace. Libel laws are used to crack down on media freedom and opposition, leaving journalists open to unwarranted defamation cases. However, EJN research in Warsaw and Krakow found that despite these highly challenging circumstances, opportunities exist to support independent voices through innovative journalistic practices and new business models.

Recommendations

The fundamental issues that threaten independent journalism in Poland require long-term solutions. The EJN fieldwork and report identified a number of recommendations on both national and local levels. These include:

1. Dialogue with official institutions

The European Union and Parliament should put pressure on the Polish authorities to deal with the media fairly and transparently. This is especially important given attempts by the government to clampdown on freedom of expression and the use of increasingly severe tactics to undermine journalism.

2. Combating legislative control

The government controls the media using archaic legislation, and current political structures are likely to make any attempts at legal reform challenging. More practical approaches would likely be effective. This



Building Trust in Journalism in Poland, September 2019. © David Sypniewski



The government controls the media using archaic legislation, and current political structures are likely to make any attempts at legal reform challenging.

should include working alongside legal defence teams and NGOs which provide legal expertise to the media and journalists to develop case studies that could provide greater protection against laws being used to clamp down on freedom of expression.

3. Networks and collaboration

Many stakeholders in the Polish media who were interviewed reported successful attempts to forge support networks, including content sharing and peer-to-peer learning in Poland and more widely across Europe This should continue with further areas of collaboration encouraged, perhaps involving international networks such as the European Journalism Centre (EJC), the Global Investigative Journalism Network (GIJN) and the International Centre for Investigative Journalists (ICIJ).

4. Capacity building

A bespoke program for journalists working in Poland should be developed to address key professional and ethical skills and principles, as well as emerging journalistic fields such as data journalism and artificial intelligence (AI). A 'Training of Trainers' model aimed at journalists and editors would help promote bestpractice methods for the long term.

5. Innovative business and content models

Identifying new business models could allow independent media to grow at a national, local and community level, reflecting changing patterns of content consumption. These should incorporate a better understanding of news consumption habits with a greater focus on younger audiences and address their growing engagement with social media. Entertainment and drama programming could also play a role in delivering key messages to citizens.

6. Content-sharing

One innovation in the media which has proven successful in Poland is the content-sharing project, 'Spięcie'. Independent media are recognising the value



of hosting a larger stable of diverse and distinctive content, providing their audiences with greater access to news, views and debates in a polarised society.

7. Cyber and physical harassment

Journalists are increasingly being attacked by trolls whose aim is to quash freedom of expression using vicious tactics and modes of harassment. These incidents need to be documented by journalists with media freedom and journalism safety institutes and work should be done to identify where they are originating and how they are orchestrated.

8. Media literacy

A media-literate audience would encourage greater professionalism and allow for more innovation and development of content. Polish citizens need initiatives to help them engage with and understand the narratives of the media through targeted media literacy projects.

9. Higher education and training

Media studies have been largely disregarded and this needs to improve. Polish society would benefit from a sharp improvement in this area of education. Academic studies of the media lack practical application and include very little training on journalism skills. There are limited opportunities for mentorships and internships available to students. Capacity-building and curriculum development support should be given to institutions willing to update their approach.

Bulgaria

The EJN's work in 2020 highlights the challenges and opportunities faced by Bulgarian media. Based on a number of interviews with key media stakeholders, the report found press freedom and professional journalistic practice to be under severe threat. Bulgaria has the lowest ranking of press freedom in Europe. Reporters Sans Frontiers put Bulgaria's Press Freedom Ranking at 111th place globally in 2020. Pro-government allies and oligarchs retain media control and sensational and tabloid journalism thrive at the expense of quality outlets. Bulgarian media is divided based on attitudes towards the principles of journalism. There are those who produce quality ethical content and those who see the media as a tool for propaganda. Much of the media is funded by those with political and financial connections with the government and those in power. Independence in the television market has been almost destroyed.

Press freedom is under attack and critics are silenced with financial and security threats. Job security is extremely low, and self-censorship is used to avoid harassment and intimidation. Accuracy, accountability and impartiality are under threat. Fact-checking is often excluded from the editorial and publication process in many newsrooms. Hate speech is often published in mainstream media against certain minority groups and women and there is little evidence of any regulation or protocols in practice to counter this. Trust in the media, like trust in the state, is at an all-time low.



Recommendations

1. Continued dialogue with EU institutions

The EU and the European Commission need to monitor corruption and media freedom and use financial pressure on the government and legislators to improve the situation. EU institutions should also be compelled to monitor the allocation of grants and financial awards.

2. Support independence in public media institutions

The role of public service media is one which is being debated on a global scale. Key challenges in the Bulgarian context include establishing funding models that are sustainable and independent, producing innovative content that is also in the public interest, and attracting diverse audiences.

3. Development of new business models

There are a number of independent media outlets trying to counter some of the mainstream narratives and tackle corruption in the political sphere. Alternative business models should be considered from local and community-based support, through to greater content sharing – as a means to develop longer-term, sustainable independent media platforms.

4. Regional networking

The opportunity to learn from peers working in comparable environments would encourage solidarity through shared learnings and experiences. Crossborder, joint investigations and co-productions between groups would build more lasting links between organisations.

5. Human rights, gender and minority sensitive reporting

Small grants supported by training and development focusing on human rights – led reporting would encourage programming in minority languages. Developing networks to support journalists can build collaboration and foster greater tolerance of minority rights issues and immigration.

6. Media literacy

Bulgarian media audiences are confused about the role the media can play in supporting democratic principles and socially cohesive societies. Initiatives which engage the public in the creation and dissemination of media content will provide them with a greater understanding of journalists' work.

7. Higher education

While universities in Bulgaria do provide some teaching which focuses on teaching professional journalism skills, journalism education is generally underfunded and requires further support in order to encourage future journalists into the profession. The curriculum needs to focus more on minority and gender representation, and build partnerships with universities abroad for knowledge exchange which would benefit the industry.

8. Security and safety

Bulgarian journalists are dealing with increasing attacks from the government and allied media platforms. Smear campaigns are widespread. Attacks need to be documented and followed up with support from media freedom and journalism safety organisations.

Regional and international support networks should be set up to assist with ongoing harassment.

Next Steps

This project is continuing its work in Bulgaria, Hungary and Poland as well as conducting fieldwork in the Czech Republic and Slovakia in order to produce similar assessments of the industries in those countries and their possibilities for ethical journalism. Our work is considering how recent transitions in the region, combined with the challenges which have been further enhanced by the Covid-19 pandemic, might be influencing journalistic practices. Ultimately, this project will provide tools and resources which will support journalists in these countries in providing the much-needed independent content their audiences want and trust.

Changing the way we work because of Covid

All of the interviews for this report were conducted remotely over the phone or via online platforms. The Covid-19 public health crisis restricted travel to Bulgaria to conduct the research. For this reason, the EJN is grateful to a number of Bulgarian media stakeholders who supported the production of this report by providing the required information, feedback and review in order to ensure that the nuances of the Bulgarian socio-cultural and political landscapes were fully captured. This paper also draws on a number of other reports and research studies into the Bulgarian media. These include a number of reports produced by Reporters Sans Frontières (RSF), including their White Paper on media freedom in Bulgaria and another report in 2018 on challenges to investigative journalism.

Covid-19 increases challenge to Bulgarian media

The bleak picture of the media in Bulgaria has further intensified during the Covid-19 pandemic. The lack of financial security and sustainability of independent media is expected to worsen with evidence of the closure of some small independent media outlets, or salary cuts and delayed wages. Journalists are reporting from the frontline, asking the right questions but with little support from the government. Local health bodies and institutions monitoring the pandemic are refusing to provide data and information to journalists who are producing investigative work into the government's handling of the crisis. Participants in the project from the public media were also concerned that they were expected to report on lockdown rules and regulations but were not allowed to criticise the measures taken by the authorities. A lack of trust of the media by the public has also become more apparent. They have blamed journalists for failing to criticise the measures, rather than focus on the government's lack of engagement with reporters on the issue. The environment does not look promising in terms of independent media seeking to hold power to account.

Balkans Building Trust in Media in South-East Europe and Turkey

The Ethical Journalism Network's project in the Western Balkans and Turkey made substantial progress over the last 18 months. January 2020 saw the beginning of the second phase of the programme, during which the EJN has worked with, coached and guided seven media outlets across Albania and Serbia with the aim of helping them implement our ethical audit process.



Begun four years ago as a UNESCO/EU funded project, the EJN has been working with colleagues from Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kosovo, Montenegro, North Macedonia, Serbia and Turkey to improve good practice in media practice and reporting across the region.

As part of the process, the 'Balkan Network for Trusted Media', was founded in March 2019, bringing together experts from the EJN with local practitioners and working in partnership with the global Journalism Trust Initiative (JTI), led by Reporters Without Borders (RSF).

JTI aims to create a mechanism to reward media outlets for providing guarantees regarding transparency, verification and correction methods, editorial independence and compliance with ethical norms. The EJN contributed to development of the JTI standard that is now used in implementation of the Building Trust in Media in South East Europe and Turkey project.

By the end of this multi-year project (early 2022), the EJN team aims to have audited 20 media outlets.

Our partners are asked to display their commitment to moving towards better ethical practice, standards, self-regulation and good governance, with the EJN, ensuring each is fully signed to the JTI principles.





I often think our jobs would be much easier and far more lucrative if we were corrupted and not independent, rather than principled and facing verbal attacks, trolls, and smears. Fortunately, ethics and integrity are something that the team prides itself on so this audit was a reaffirmation that we were on the right track.

- Alice Taylor, Exit Deputy Editor

The EJN team carried out a combination of activities including, mentoring, consulting and coaching a mixture of editors, directors and journalists. This work with partners took place both in person – before COVID-19 and then virtually.

The work we provide includes mentoring, consulting and coaching editors, directors and journalists. virtually. At the time of writing, three media outlets -Exit News, Politiko and Istinomer – had successfully completed their work to overhaul their practices and examine their activities within an ethical framework. All three have now signed up to the JTI pilot project led by Reporters without Borders.

The Building Trust in Media in South East Europe and Turkey project has succeeded in reigniting the debate about ethical standards to the Western Balkans and Turkey. Media organisations have successfully improved their editorial guidance, privacy policies and mission statements, as a result of completing the work with the EJN, and will over time bring concrete change and improvement to journalism in the region.



Turkey

Journalists and press freedom are coming increasingly under attack in Turkey. Being a journalist there is difficult. Regulatory institutions lack independence and the government has recently brought in a new social media law to clamp down on the remaining spaces for free comment. Journalists are being jailed, prosecuted and persecuted for their work. Because of the nature of the threats in Turkey, the EJN's objective is to help strengthen journalism and media through education, skills training and awareness-raising.

During this period, we continued supporting the Coalition for Ethical Journalism in Turkey through project work funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Fritt Ord. Though we provide support and expertise where needed, the CEJT is coordinated by our Turkish colleagues, led by Mustafa Kuleli, who is the General Secretary of the Turkish Union of Journalists, as well as a Board member of the European Federation of Journalists.

The CEJT has continued to provide much-needed support for journalists who live and work in an environment where there are significant pressures on media freedom, editorial independence and ethical practice. It has brought people together to share challenges and discuss solutions and crucially, through its achievements, the CEJT has shown that even in hostile environments, good practice in ethical journalism is a source of solidarity.

This year saw the launch of a bilingual web platform to provide CEJT resources on journalism, as well as updates about the Coalition's activities. Future activities are planned to build on current work, specifically building training materials around the core ethical





The Coalition for Ethical Journalism
Turkey not only works for censorshipfree, independent journalism but also
quality journalism which is much
needed in the country. CEJT workshops
and articles published on the CEJT
website helps to increase the quality of
journalism.

- Mustafa Kuleli, CEJT coordinator

principles of journalism and goodgovernance. Priority areas also include practical work to identify and combat disinformation, how to deal with hate speech and reporting on issues such as terrorism, migration, and gender.



Before the Covid-19 pandemic struck, restricting international travel and face to face meetings, the CEJT's coordination team met in Istanbul, Diyarbakir, Izmir, supported by the EJN's UK team. At a meeting in Diyarbakir in November 2019, the coalition held workshops on gender-sensitive reporting, on combatting hate speech and finalised a glossary for media practitioners.

In addition to the project specific work, the EJN participated in complementary activities to support the CEJT, including setting up consultative meetings with partner organisations in Istanbul, and the delivery of a workshop on combatting gendered online harassment for journalists.

Despite journalism being under attack in Turkey, there is a real attachment to and appetite for the core values of ethical journalism: transparency, independence, accuracy, accountability and humanity. This is the case across Turkey and resonates with individual journalists, in institutions and across the industry.

Self-censorship prevails at almost every level of journalism and the environment is one of uncertainty of salaried employment, threat of harassment, arrest and imprisonment, and a pervading sense of unease and distrust. Media practitioners limit the scope of their work, fearing the repercussions of speaking up. The majority of media ownership is concentrated in the hands of a wealthy and connected minority. But networks such as the CEJT enables members to feel less isolated, to share solutions to mutual challenges and to build peer support programmes for good practice. Only with a long-term strategy of support which fully involves Turkish journalists at every stage, will the media community gain confidence in the values of a free press and ethical journalism.

The work and continuation of the CEJT is absolutely crucial to conversations around support to media in

Turkey. This independent and non-political group is a voluntary coalition. Any organisation or journalist can join or withdraw at any time. It brings together and empowers those who remain committed to the core values of journalism and who want to work together to strengthen news media. Although it welcomes international support, the CEJT has declared itself first and foremost a Turkish coalition, organised and driven bylocal priorities. It will be self-motivated and aims to be a long-term initiative helping Turkish journalists to strengthen independent journalism. The EJN is privileged to have been able to support it and hope to be able to continue to do so in the future.

2020 saw a series of twelve articles commissioned by journalists and academics. These were on the following subjects: The critical role of environmental journalists", "Refugee coverage in the media ", "Reporting on corruption and investigative journalism", "Gender equality and media", "Hate speech and new discrimination in national and local media", "National security and journalism" "Femicide coverage" and "LGBTI+ representation and wording issues", which formed the initial set of articles. "War and conflict reporting and ethics", "Ethical issues in local media through a gender perspective", "the blurred boundaries between journalism and activism in Turkey" as well as "Visual ethics in journalism" were among a subsequent series of articles.

Migration in Pakistan

Enabling ethical reporting on migration topics has been an important part of the EJN's work. From producing editorial guidelines to supporting fellowships, developing content and online learning, we have worked with journalists in Europe and across the Global South to help them consider the specific contexts within which they work and develop their practices accordingly.

The EJN began working with the International Centre for Migration Policy and Debate in 2019 on a project to support journalists in Iraq and Pakistan reporting on migration. A workshop was held in Istanbul in December 2019 with over 30 journalists, editors and investigative reporters, during which we explored issues such as language, legal issues and the uses of images.

We went on to further develop our partnership, devising and producing bespoke guidelines for journalists reporting on migration in Pakistan. The FJN conducted a series of consultative workshops

with Pakistani news organisations, and will deliver individual training and mentoring throughout 2021. As part of the project, we will mentor 10 journalists who will receive ICMPD grants, our role being to support them to directly apply ethical practice in their in-depth funded reporting.

The guidelines were published and presented in time for 'International Migrants Day' in December 2020. Further work will include an additional series of workshops and a mentoring programme for journalists in Pakistan throughout 2021.

Momenta Migration Course

The EJN worked in conjunction with the International Centre for Migration Policy Development and Oxford University's Migration Observatory to run a three-month training and mentoring course for seventeen journalists from Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Moldova, Ukraine and Russia. Workshops were held in Moldova and Kyiv, with a final training course in Prague.





Sometimes in the midst of some very taxing work on gender we tend to lose an analytical lens that is very personal and profound. I want to send my gratitude to EJN and Aida Kaisy in particular for reminding me of how central migration politics has been to my being and for the millions residing across Pakistan.

Working with EJN was as much of an intellectual exercise as it was a personal journey into migration trauma that were inflicted on my parents' generation and which were then passed onto our generation. It is in this immersion that I began to find hope and 'home' deeply intertwined – cities that have been able to heal old migration wounds are better able to forge a home for the many.

It is also through this exercise that I was able to understand Pakistan's emerging crises around internal migration, citizenry, ethnicity and a weak democracy. I'd like to thank the EJN for helping me get to this point with their patient, conscientious and layered feedback. It allowed me to undo some old assumptions and learn more about best practices in migration reporting and the right terminologies to deploy.

We hope to now transfer this knowledge to experienced editors as well as young and upcoming journalists in the hopes that the pervasiveness of migration in reporting is acknowledged and news reports on emergent migration politics can effectively deploy the intersectionality of migration politics in national polity.

- Tasneem Ahmar, Executive Director, Uks Media Research Centre



Partnerships

We are grateful to the following for their financial support to the EJN this past year:

- Bath Spa University (DESTIN project)
- Centro per la Cooperazione Internationale
- Civil Rights Defenders
- Egmont Publishing/TV2 Norway
- European Federation of Journalists
- European Union Fundamental Rights Agency
- Evens Foundation
- Free Press Unlimited
- Fritt Ord Foundation
- International Centre for Media Policy Development
- International Media Support
- Kopinor
- MBL (Norwegian Media Business Association)
- Mentor Medier
- Nent Group/P4
- Norwegian Institute of Journalism

- Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe
- Polaris Media
- Schibsted News
- The David and Elaine Potter Foundation
- The Stanley Foundation (Stanley Center for Peace and Security)
- Tinius Trust
- Ugur Mumcu Investigative Journalism Foundation
- UNESCO

In 2021, we are looking forward to continuing to work with our supporters and we are particularly grateful to the Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust for their recent agreement of funding for a new project addressing structural racism in the UK news industry.

Poynter Institute

As part of our hope to build a more formal partnership and collaborate across issues to do with ethics and journalism, we underwrote a webinar with the Poynter Institute on dignity in reporting on race and identity. It was led by Cristi Hegranes of Global Press and is now part of Poynter library for training journalists with free access to our network. We also published on our website two related articles, one from Cristi on the topic of the webinar, and one from Poynter's Director of Training and Diversity Doris Truong, entitled 'Dear newsroom managers, journalists of color can't do all the work', which had previously been published by Poynter.



- Randi Ogrey

Internews Europe

In June 2020, the EJN and Internews Europe launched a joint series of articles, seeking to highlight the ethics of reporting on the Covid-19 pandemic. "Ethics in Practice" spotlights the experiences of journalists, civil rights activists and health experts around the world working to raise awareness of the pandemic and the challenges they face, from addressing the absence of marginalised voices, to the rising trend of "copy-paste journalism". The series complemented the EJN's existing Ethics in the News series of articles at the intersection of ethics and contemporaneous journalism issues, and offered different voices and perspectives from partners who work with Internews.

Asia-Pacific Broadcasting Union (ABU)

We have collaborated with the Asia-Pacific Broadcasting Union (ABU) on a number of occasions in recent years. Hannah Storm and EJN founder Aidan White took part in the Global News Forum in Istanbul, participating in panels on ethical journalism. At the International Radio Forum in Seoul, Hannah interviewed Professor Moon Chung-In, the special adviser to South Korean President Moon Jae-In for Foreign Affairs and National Security. They discussed the media's role in peace-building in the Korean Peninsula in an interview which was also broadcast in North Korea and made headlines across South Korea.

Since the pandemic began, our collaboration has been virtual. We held a webinar building on our infographic about the ethical coverage of Covid-19. The ABU's head of radio, Olya Booyar, said it was 'perfectly pitched' for ABU members.

'It came at a time in the COVID-19 pandemic when broadcasters around the world were seeking good advice on how to deal with the avalanche of changing information, conflicting opinions and fake news.

Dozens of our members around the Asia-Pacific region logged in and stayed with your presentation to the very end, remaining eager to discuss several aspects of the excellent infographic you presented. Two major Asia-Pacific broadcasting networks actually streamed the webinar live into their seminar halls so more staff could attend!'

Tools and Training





Free and real journalism is a precondition for a vital democracy. The Norwegian media model based on professional rules, self-regulation and participation from all media partners, has proven valuable. I find it inspiring using our experience to discuss and strengthen journalism worldwide.

- Thomas Spence, EJN Trustee

Journalism, peace and nuclear proliferation - humanity

In May 2020, the EJN started working with The Stanley Centre for Peace to explore how journalists can better report on nuclear and security issues. The purpose of the work was to help journalists and data analysts, who look at geospatial and open source data, in order to improve coverage of these issues.

The EJN carried out a total of thirty-five interviews with journalists from a variety of organisations, including The Guardian, NPR, Reuters, Bellingcat, Kings' College London, the International Institute for Strategic Studies, and Berkeley, University of California. The aim was to devise a set of guidelines that could be shared across the industry, and then to work with the Stanley Center to develop policy recommendations.

The Stanley Centre is due to report back to the EJN by the close of 2020. The findings will be used as part of an ongoing partnership to develop policy recommendations.



Jordan Media Institute is very proud of more than five years of cooperation with EJN. Former EJN Director Aidan White addressed our Master's program students in 2015 and was keynote speaker at an international conference on hate speech in digital and social media that JMI hosted in 2016. And in 2019, JMI, with support from the network, developed a glossary on hate speech for Jordanian media. The project sought to promote the concept of ethical journalism and responsible communications for young journalists and editors.

- Bayan Tal, Senior Advisor, Jordan Media Institute

Ethical Audits

Ethical media audits allow us to work closely alongside partner media organisations to assess the processes they have in place to ensure good governance in their working practices and content, and in the relationship they have with their audiences. Through the EJN's close work with partner news outlets, we work to monitor existing policies and processes, identify gaps, and support in the development of documents and codes that uphold ethical standards in their output and in their work environments.

EJN Considerations

Putting ethics into practice is central to the EJN's work to raise standards in newsrooms around the world. By drawing on our network's knowledge and expertise, we produce and share toolkits and tip sheets to provide newsrooms, journalists and those in journalism teaching with guidance on how to responsibly report every day. The EJN prides itself on being able to react to world events and can call on the knowledge a broad range of experts.. Sometimes out practical tips might address specific themes and topics in the news, such as our infographic for ethical coverage of pandemics. Once finalised, they are shared online and often translated into several languages. We are also able to build on these specifically for newsrooms to create more in-depth understanding of coverage of often sensitive issues and support good practice in all types of storytelling.

Sharing Expertise

EJN'S HATE SPEECH GLOSSARY

A substantial amount of the EJN's work aims to provide journalists with resources to identify and address hate speech in their reporting. One of the most effective ways to help to embed best practice is to develop a glossary of language to help journalists consider how they frame contentious stories. The EJN has been working to develop these for both the Palestinian and Jordanian media in order to help newsrooms think about language and context.

The EJN, together with local partners and academics in each country, worked to create these glossaries through detailed monitoring and content analysis across key media platforms. Local partners then considered the socio-cultural landscape of each country and how the particular words or phrases might be used and seen as inciting hatred.

The Palestinian project focused on media organisations allied to two main political groups. Once the teams had agreed draft glossaries, they were presented to a journalists and academics at the Arab Reporters for Investigative Journalism (ARIJ) conferences in 2018 and then again in 2019. This process allowed feedback from the media community to inform the finished glossary.

The Jordanian glossary was also presented to a group of key media stakeholders at the Jordan Media Institute (JMI) the project's partner. The JMI now continues to use it as a resource in their journalism training programmes.



As someone who has worked with news publishers and broadcasters for most of my career, I am an avid believer in the freedom of the press to report as it sees fit whilst at the same time encouraging the adoption and upholding of appropriate ethical standards so that the public can trust the veracity of news reporting.

- Jane Clemetson, EJN Trustee

DESTIN PROJECT

Journalism Education for Democracy in Ukraine: Developing Standards, Integrity and Professionalism

Improving media literacy is a key part of the EJN's work to promote ethical journalism. It is one method of ensuring journalists begin their careers with a thorough understanding of good practice.

The Destin project, coordinated by Bath Spa University, in partnership with the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Institute of Journalism, aims to improve and develop Ukrainian journalism education. By reviewing and reforming current BA and MA programmes, it aims to improve students' chances of gaining employment, their likelihood of working internationally while promoting wider media literacy.

We have been working to advise our Ukrainian partners on possible courses for their journalism curricula including ones on gender- sensitive reporting and ethical migration reporting. We responded flexibly to the changing environment created by Covid-19 by suggesting a course on the ethical reporting on pandemics, ensuring that students were current with their learning. Based on the EJN's suggestions, the universities design and deliver the courses online and the EJN takes a supervisory role.

This project is a great example of how an organisation can make a lasting difference to the journalism community by instilling solid ethical foundations in teaching and learning.

EJN welcomes new trustees

The Ethical Journalism Network boosted its footprint in the UK, bringing a number of high-profile appointments of significant industry figures to its board. The six new trustees bring significant experience, diverse perspectives, and new insights to the work of the UK-based charity.

Ayshah Tull is an award-winning reporter for Channel 4 News. She joined the programme in 2019, and her broadcasting has included reporting the US elections on the ground and extensive coverage of the coronavirus crisis. She previously presented the children's news programme, BBC Newsround from 2013-2018.

Christo Hird is the founder and managing director of Dartmouth Films, which focuses on producing and distributing theatric documentaries with a social and public purpose. His career includes working in The City, being a journalist on the Economist, New Statesman (where he was deputy editor) and the Sunday Times (where he was editor of Insight), as well as being a television reporter and producer.

James Ball is an investigative journalist and author, currently working as the global editor at the Bureau of Investigative Journalism. He has previously worked at outlets including BuzzFeed News and the Guardian, on projects including the offshore leaks, WikiLeaks war logs, state cables and the NSA leaks

from Edward Snowden. His latest book is *The System: Who Owns The Internet And How It Owns Us.*

Jane Clemetson is Director of Commercial Legal Affairs at British media group Reach plc. Prior to that she founded a legal and business affairs consultancy which worked with companies including ITN, Trinity Mirror (now Reach), News International, Sony Music and EMI.

She is Education Officer for Reach's internal Diversity, Inclusion and Belonging Committee and a member of Reach's working group on Reaching Gender Equality in Sport. Jane also represents Reach on numerous industry bodies and committees, including the National Media Association's Legal Public Policy and Regulatory Affairs Committee.

Keme Nzerem is an award-winning TV News correspondent, presenter and filmmaker who has reported from around the world on issues from corruption, politics, and human rights, to sport. His focus has been on how global events affect the lives of ordinary people.

He has spent most of his staff

career at Channel 4 News and has covered major stories including the #blacklivesmatter protests of 2020, the Grenfell fire, the election of Barack Obama, Hurricane Katrina, paedophiles in football, and World Cups & Olympic Games. Keme is currently making a feature documentary about the legacy of the enslavement of Africans. He is also a media trainer, running his own consultancy company.

Manisha Tank has been a broadcast journalist for twenty years, working her way up from Assistant Producer at Reuters Television in London to anchoring flagship current affairs and business programs for BBC World News and CNN International for more than a decade.

Her career has spanned three continents and the world's biggest financial news hubs, New York, Hong Kong and Singapore, where she now resides. Manisha runs her own media services company, and is a regular face on the events circuit in the Asia Pacific region. She also hosts a news and current affairs breakfast radio show owned by Singapore's SPH Holdings, the publisher of the *Straits Times*.





There's nothing like a pandemic to remind us all how vital quality journalism is, and how many different ways it's under threat. As we report on issues of the highest of stakes, while working in new ways, it couldn't be more important to work out what ethical journalism means in these different situations in which we find ourselves. I've long admired EJN as a platform and a voice in these debates, and am looking forward to getting more involved in the future as a trustee.

- James Ball, EJN Trustee

